

## **CHAPTER 4**

## CHAPTER 4 FUZZY RELATION EQUATIONS ON UNION AND INTERSECTION PRESERVING OPERATORS

In this chapter we study union and intersection preserving operators defined on  $I$  and discuss fuzzy relation equations based on these operators.

### 4.1 UNION AND INTERSECTION PRESERVING OPERATORS:

**Definition 4.1.1** [L]: A binary operation  $*$  on  $I$  is said to be union preserving operator if

- 1)  $a * 0 = 0$
- 2)  $a * (\sup_{i \in I} b_i) = \sup_{i \in I} (a * b_i), \forall a, b_i \in I.$

**Definition 4.1.2**[L]: A binary operation  $\bullet$  on  $I$  is said to be intersection preserving operator if

- 1)  $a \bullet 1 = 1$
- 2)  $a \bullet (\inf_{i \in I} b_i) = \inf_{i \in I} (a \bullet b_i) \forall a, b_i \in I.$

**Theorem 4.1.3** [L]: The union preserving operator  $*$  is an order preserving operator.

Proof: Let  $a, b, c \in I$  and  $b \leq c$ . Then  $\text{Sup}\{b, c\} = c$

Now  $a * \text{sup}\{b, c\} = \text{sup}\{a * b, a * c\}$

i. e.  $a * c = \text{sup}\{a * b, a * c\}$

Therefore,  $a * c \geq a * b$ .

**Theorem 4.1.4**[L]: The intersection preserving operator  $\bullet$  is an order preserving operator.

Proof: Let  $a, b, c \in I$  and  $b \leq c$ . Then  $\inf\{b, c\} = b$

Now  $a \bullet \inf\{b, c\} = \inf\{a \bullet b, a \bullet c\}$

i. e.  $a \bullet b = \inf\{a \bullet b, a \bullet c\}$

Therefore,  $a \bullet b \leq a \bullet c$ .

**Theorem 4.1.5 [L]:** If  $*$  is an union preserving operator, then there exists a unique intersection preserving operator  $\bullet$  such that  $a * b \leq c$  if and only if  $a \bullet c \geq b$

Proof: Define a mapping  $*$ :  $I \times I \rightarrow I$  as follows

$$a \bullet c = \sup_{x \in B} \{x\}, \text{ where } B = \{x \in I \mid a * x \leq c\}$$

Since  $a * 0 \leq 0$ ,  $a * 0 \leq c$ , for all  $c \in I$

Therefore,  $0 \in B$

i. e.  $B \neq \phi$ .

Therefore,  $B$  is a bounded subset of  $[0, 1]$  bounded by 0 and 1.

Hence,  $\bullet$  is well defined.

Let  $a * b \leq c$ . Then  $b \in B$

Therefore,  $a \bullet c = \sup_{x \in B} \{x\} \geq b$

Thus,  $a \bullet c \geq b$

Conversely let  $a \bullet c \geq b$ . Then  $a * b \leq a * (a \bullet c)$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Now } a * (a \bullet c) &= a * \sup_{x \in B} \{x\} \\ &= \sup_{x \in B} (a * x) \\ &\leq c \end{aligned}$$

Hence,  $a * (a \bullet c) \leq c$

Therefore,  $a * b \leq c$  if and only  $a \bullet c \geq b$

Since  $a * 1 \leq 1, 1 \in B$

Therefore,  $a * 1 \leq 1 \Rightarrow a \bullet 1 \geq 1$

Hence  $a \bullet 1 = 1$

Next, we claim that,

$$a \bullet (\inf_{i \in I} b_i) = \inf_{i \in I} (a \bullet b_i)$$

$$\text{Now } a \bullet (\inf_{i \in I} b_i) = a \bullet (\inf_{i \in I} b_i)$$

$$\text{Therefore, } a * (a \bullet \inf_{i \in I} \{b_i\}) \leq \inf_{i \in I} \{b_i\} \leq b_i, \forall i \in I$$

$$\text{iff } a \bullet b_i \geq a \bullet (\inf_{i \in I} b_i)$$

$$\text{iff } \inf_{i \in I} (a \bullet b_i) \geq a \bullet (\inf_{i \in I} b_i)$$

$$\text{Now } \inf_{i \in I} (a \bullet b_i) \leq a \bullet b_i, \forall i \in I$$

$$\text{Therefore, } a * \inf_{i \in I} (a \bullet b_i) \leq b_i, \forall i \in I.$$

$$\text{iff } a * (\inf_{i \in I} (a \bullet b_i)) \leq \inf_{i \in I} \{b_i\}$$

$$\text{iff } a \bullet \inf_{i \in I} \{b_i\} \geq \inf_{i \in I} (a \bullet b_i)$$

$$\text{Hence, } a \bullet \inf_{i \in I} \{b_i\} = \inf_{i \in I} (a \bullet b_i)$$

**Uniqueness:** Since  $a * b = a * b, a \bullet (a * b) \geq b$

Similarly  $a * (a \bullet c) \leq c$

Suppose  $\bullet_1$  is any other operator satisfying  $a * b \leq c$  if and only if  $a \bullet_1 c \geq b$ .

Now  $a * (a \bullet_1 c) \leq c$

Therefore,  $a \bullet c \geq a \bullet_1 c$

Also  $a * (a \bullet c) \leq c$

Hence,  $a \bullet_1 c \geq a \bullet c$

Therefore,  $a \bullet c = a \bullet_1 c$ .

Similarly following result holds.

**Theorem 4.1.6 [L]:** If  $\bullet$  is an intersection preserving operator, then there exists a unique union preserving operator  $*$  satisfying  $a * b \leq c$  if and only if  $a \bullet c \geq b$ ,  $\forall a, b, c, \in I$ .

Proof: Define a mapping  $*$ :  $I \times I \rightarrow I$  as follows

$$a * b = \inf_{x \in C} \{x\}, \text{ where } C = \{x \mid a \bullet x \geq b\}.$$

**Theorem 4.1.7 [L]:** Let  $a, c \in I$ . If the equation  $a * x = c$  has at least one solution, then there exists an intersection preserving operator  $\bullet$  such that  $a \bullet c$  is the maximum solution of  $a * x = c$ .

Proof: Let  $x$  be a solution of the equation  $a * x = c$ . Then  $a * x \leq c$ .

Therefore, by above Theorem 4.1.5, there exists an intersection preserving operator  $\bullet$  such that  $a \bullet c \geq x$

$$\text{Then } a * x \leq a * (a \bullet c)$$

$$\text{Therefore, } c \leq a * (a \bullet c) \leq c$$

$$\text{Hence, } a * (a \bullet c) = c$$

Let  $d \in I$  be a solution of  $a * x = c$ .

$$\text{Then } a * d \leq c$$

$$\text{Therefore, } (a \bullet c) \geq d.$$

Similarly we prove the following:

**Theorem 4.1.8** [L]: Let  $a, b \in I$ . If the equation  $a \bullet x = b$  has at least one solution, then there exists an union preserving operator  $*$  such that  $a * b$  is the minimum solution of  $a \bullet x = b$ .

**Definition 4.1.9** [L]: Operators  $*$  and  $\bullet$  defined in the above Theorems 4.1.5 are called inverse operator of each other.

**Theorem 4.1.10** [L]: If the equation  $a * x = c$  has the minimum solution,  $a \bar{\bullet} c$ , then following hold.

i)  $a * (a \bar{\bullet} c) = c$

ii)  $a \bullet c \geq a \bar{\bullet} c$

iii)  $a \bar{\bullet} (a * c) \leq c$

Proof: We only prove (iii)

iii) Since  $a \bar{\bullet} c$  is a minimum solution of  $a * x = c$ ,  $a \bar{\bullet} (a * c)$  is a minimum solution of  $a * x = a * c$

Also  $c$  is a solution of  $a * x = a * c$

Hence,  $a \bar{\bullet} (a * c) \leq c$ .

Similarly we prove the following:

**Theorem 4.1.11** [L]: If the equation  $a \bullet x = b$  has the maximum solution,  $a \bar{*} b$ , then following hold.

i)  $a \bullet (a \bar{*} b) = b$

ii)  $a * b \leq a \bar{*} b$

iii)  $a \bar{*} (a \bullet b) \geq b$ .

#### 4.2 FUZZY RELATION EQUATIONS WITH UNION PRESERVING OPERATOR:

**Definition 4.2.1:** Let  $P(X, Y)$  and  $Q(Y, Z)$  be fuzzy relations. Let  $*$  be an union preserving operator. Then  $*$  - sup composition of  $P$  and  $Q$  is a fuzzy relation,  $R(X, Z)$ , defined as follows:

$$P * Q(x, z) = \sup_{y \in Y} \{Q(x, y) * P(z, y)\}$$

**Definition 4.2.2:** Let  $P(X, Y)$ ,  $Q(Y, Z)$  and  $R(X, Z)$  be fuzzy relations. Then the equation  $P * Q = R$  is called  $*$  - sup fuzzy relation equation or fuzzy relation equation with union preserving operator  $*$ .

This problem,  $P * Q = R$ , can be partitioned into a set of simpler problems  $p_i * Q = r_i, \forall i$ .

If  $p = (p_1, p_2, \dots, p_n)$ ,  $Q = (q_{ij})_{n \times m}$  and  $r = (r_1, r_2, \dots, r_m)$ . Let  $*$  be an union preserving operator. Then  $r_j = \sup_i (q_{ij} * p_i)$

Let  $p = (p_1, p_2, \dots, p_n)$  and  $r = (r_1, r_2, \dots, r_n)$ . Then  $p \leq r$  if and only if  $p_i \leq r_i$ , for all  $i$ .

We will discuss above equation when  $Q$  and  $r$  are given.

**Theorem 4.2.3 [L]:** There exists a solution to fuzzy relation equation  $p * Q = r$  if and only if  $t * Q \geq r$ , where  $t = (t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n)$  and  $t_i = \inf_j \{q_{ij} \bullet r_j\}$ ,  $\bullet$  is inverse operator of  $*$ .

Proof: Suppose  $t * Q \geq r$ , where  $t = (t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n)$  and  $t_i = \inf_j \{q_{ij} \bullet r_j\}$ ,  $\bullet$  is inverse

operator of  $*$ .

$$\text{Now } \sup_i (q_{ij} * t_i) = \sup_i (q_{ij} * \inf_j \{q_{ik} \bullet r_k\})$$

$$\leq \sup_i (q_{ij} * \{q_{ij} \bullet r_j\})$$

$$\leq r_j$$

Thus,  $\sup_i (q_{ij} * t_i) \leq r_j, j = 1, 2, 3, \dots, m$

But  $t * Q \geq r$ . Therefore,  $\sup_i (q_{ij} * t_i) \geq r_j$

Hence,  $\sup_i (q_{ij} * t_i) = r_j, j = 1, 2, \dots, m$

Thus,  $t * Q = r$

i. e.  $t$  is a solution of equation  $p * Q = r$ .

Conversely suppose that  $t$  is a solution of equation  $p * Q = r$ .

Therefore,  $t * Q = r$

i. e.  $\sup_i (q_{ij} * t_i) = r_j, j = 1, 2, \dots, m$ .

Thus,  $\sup_i (q_{ij} * t_i) \geq r_j, j = 1, 2, \dots, m$

i. e.  $t * Q \geq r$

**Theorem 4.2.4 [L]:** Given  $Q$  and  $r$  if we define  $t_i = \inf_j (q_{ij} \bullet r_j) \forall i = 1, 2, \dots, n$ , then

$t = (t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n)$  is the maximum solution of the equation  $p * Q = r$ .

Proof: Let  $u = (u_1, u_2, \dots, u_n)$  be a solution of  $p * Q = r$

Then  $r_j = \sup_i (q_{ij} * u_i), \forall j$

Now  $t_i = \inf_j (q_{ij} \bullet r_j)$

$$= \inf_j [q_{ij} \bullet \sup_k (q_{kj} * u_k)]$$

$$\geq \inf_j [q_{ij} \bullet (q_{ij} * u_i)]$$

$$\geq \inf_j u_i$$



$$\geq u_j$$

Therefore,  $t_i \geq u_i$ , for all  $i = 1, 2, 3, \dots, n$ .

Thus,  $t \geq u$

Let us assume that there exists solutions to the equation  $p * Q = r$  so that  $t = (t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n)$  with  $t_i = \inf_j (q_{ij} \bullet r_j) \forall i = 1, 2, \dots, n$ , is the maximum solution. To obtain minimal solution of  $p * Q = r$  for  $p$ , we shall introduce a matrix  $D = (d_{ij})_{n \times m}$  as follows:

$$d_{ij} = \begin{cases} q_{ij} \bar{\bullet} r_j, & \text{if } q_{ij} * t_i = r_j \\ 0, & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Here  $a \bar{\bullet} b$  is the minimum solution of  $a * x = b$ .

We assume that the minimum solution of  $a * x = b$  exists.

**Theorem 4.2.5 [L]:** Define  $D^* = (d_{ij}^*)_{n \times m}$  is a submatrix of matrix  $D$ , where  $d_{ij}^* = d_{ij}$  or 0. If  $\sup_i d_{ij}^* > 0$ , for  $r_j \neq 0, j = 1, 2, \dots, m$ , then  $A = (a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n)$  where  $a_i = \sup_j d_{ij}^*, i = 1, 2, 3, \dots, n$  is a solution of the equation  $p * Q = r$ .

**Proof:** Let  $r_j \neq 0$ . Then there exists  $i_0$  such that,

$$d_{i_0 j}^* = d_{i_0 j} > 0$$

$$\text{Now } \sup_i (q_{ij} * a_i) \geq q_{i_0 j} * a_{i_0}$$

$$\geq q_{i_0 j} * \sup_i d_{i_0 j}^*$$

$$\geq q_{i_0 j} * d_{i_0 j}^*$$

$$= q_{i_0 j} * (q_{i_0 j} \bar{\bullet} r_j)$$

$$= r_j$$

Now  $D = (d_{ij})_{n \times m}$

$$d_{ij} = \begin{cases} q_{ij} \bar{r}_j, & \text{if } q_{ij} * t_i = r_j \\ 0, & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Therefore,  $q_{ij} \bar{r}_j = q_{ij} \bar{(q_{ij} * t_i)} \leq t_i$

Hence,  $a_i = \sup_j d_{ij}^* = \sup_j d_{ij}$

$$= \sup_j (q_{ij} \bar{r}_j)$$

$$= \sup_j t_i$$

$$= t_i$$

Thus,  $\sup_i (q_{ij} * a_i) \leq \sup_i (q_{ij} * t_i) = r_j, j = 1, 2, \dots, m$

i. e.  $\sup_i (q_{ij} * a_i) \leq r_j, j = 1, 2, 3, \dots, m$

Hence,  $A = (a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n)$  is a solution of  $p * Q = r$

**Theorem 4.2.6 [L]:** If  $A = (a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n)$  is a solution of equation  $p * Q = r$ , then

$D(A) = (d(A)_{ij})_{n \times m}$ , is a submatrix of  $D$  and  $\sup_i d_{ij}^* > 0$  for  $r_j \neq 0, j = 1, 2, 3, \dots, m$ ,

where

$$d(A)_{ij} = \begin{cases} d_{ij}, & q_{ij} * a_i = r_j \\ 0, & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Proof: Since  $t = (t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n)$  is the maximum solution,  $a_i \leq t_i, i = 1, 2, 3, \dots, n$

Hence,  $q_{ij} * t_i \geq q_{ij} * a_i$

i. e.  $q_{ij} * a_i \geq r_j$

Now  $q_{ij} * t_i = q_{ij} * (\inf_k (r_{ik} \bar{r}_k))$

$$\leq q_{ij} * (q_{ij} \bar{r}_j)$$

$$\leq r_j$$

$$\text{Thus, } q_{ij} * t_i = r_j$$

$$\text{Hence, } q_{ij} * t_i = r_j$$

Therefore,  $D(A)$  is a submatrix of  $D$

If  $A = (a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n)$  is a solution of  $p * Q = r$ , then  $\sup_i (r_{ij} * a_i) = r_j, j = 1, 2, 3, \dots, m$

For  $r_j \neq 0$ , there exists  $i_0$  such that,  $r_{i_0 j} * a_{i_0} = r_j$

Therefore,  $d(A)_{i_0 j} \geq 0$

Hence,  $\sup_i d(A)_{ij} > 0, j = 1, 2, 3, \dots, m$

**Theorem 4.2.7 [L]:**  $\sup_j d(A)_{ij} \leq a_i$

Proof:

$$d_{ij} = \begin{cases} q_{ij} \bar{\bullet} r_j, & \text{if } q_{ij} * t_i = r_j \\ 0, & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Also

$$d(A)_{ij} = \begin{cases} d_{ij}, & q_{ij} * a_i = r_j \\ 0, & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Therefore,  $d(A)_{ij} = q_{ij} \bar{\bullet} r_j$

Since  $A = (a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n)$  is a solution,  $d_{ij}^* = d_{ij}$  or 0 with  $a_i = \sup_j d_{ij}^*$

Therefore,  $d(A)_{ij} = q_{ij} \bar{\bullet} r_j = q_{ij} \bar{\bullet} (q_{ij} * a_i) \leq a_i$ , for  $r_j \neq 0$

Hence,  $\sup_i d(A)_{ij} \leq a_i$ , for  $r = 1, 2, 3, \dots, n$

### Method for calculating all minimal solutions [L]

Step1: Write the formula P of the matrix by

$$P = \Pi \left( \sum_{i=1}^n d_{ij} \right), \text{ product over } j, r_j \neq 0.$$

(If  $d_{ij} = 0$ , then omit it)

Here, ' $\Sigma$ ' indicates the logical 'or' and ' $\Pi$ ' indicates the logical 'and'

Then calculate P in  $\Sigma$  form according to polynomial multiplication as:

$$P_1 = \Sigma d_{k1}l_1 d_{k2}l_2 \dots d_{kr}l_r$$

Step 2: 'Multiply' for all terms

$$d_{pq} \cdot d_{rs} = \begin{cases} \max(d_{pq}, d_{rs}) & r = p \\ \text{unchanged} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases},$$

until the term  $d_{k1}l_1 d_{k2}l_2 \dots d_{kr}l_r$  satisfies  $k_i \neq k_j$  for  $i \neq j$

Step 3: 'Sum' among terms

$$d_1r_1 d_2r_2 \dots d_n r_n - d_1s_1 d_2s_2 \dots d_n s_n$$

$$= \begin{cases} d_1r_1 d_2r_2 \dots d_n r_n, d_k r_k \leq d_k s_k, k = 1, \dots, n \\ \text{unchanged,} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

All the minimal solutions are given by  $t^* = (t_1^*, t_2^*, \dots, t_n^*)$ , where  $t_k^* = d_k r_k$ ,

$k = 1, 2, 3, \dots, n$

#### 4.3 FUZZY RELATION EQUATIONS WITH INTERSECTION PRESERVING OPERATOR

**Definition 4.3.1:** Let  $P(X, Y)$  and  $Q(Y, Z)$  be fuzzy relations. Let  $\bullet$  be an intersection preserving operator. Then  $\bullet$  - inf composition of  $P$  and  $Q$  is a fuzzy relation,  $R(X, Z)$ , defined as follows:

$$P \bullet Q(x, z) = \inf_{y \in Y} \{Q(x, y) \bullet P(z, y)\}$$

**Definition 4.3.2:** Let  $P(X, Y)$ ,  $Q(Y, Z)$  and  $R(X, Z)$  be fuzzy relations. Then the equation  $P \bullet Q = R$  is called  $\bullet$  - inf fuzzy relation equation or fuzzy relation equation with intersection preserving operator  $\bullet$ .

This problem,  $P \bullet Q = R$ , can be partitioned into a set of simpler problems  $p_i \bullet Q = r_i, \forall i$ .

If  $p = (p_1, p_2, \dots, p_n)$ ,  $Q = (q_{ij})_{n \times m}$  and  $r = (r_1, r_2, \dots, r_m)$ . Let  $\bullet$  be an intersection preserving operator. Then  $r_j = \inf_i (q_{ij} \bullet p_i)$ , for  $j = 1, 2, \dots, m$

We will discuss above equation when  $Q$  and  $r$  are given and give the method for obtaining maximal solutions.

The proofs of the following theorems 4.3.3 to 4.3.7 can be obtained dually from Theorem 4.2.3 to Theorem 4.2.7 respectively.

**Theorem 4.3.3 [L]:** There exists a solution to fuzzy relation equation  $p \bullet Q = r$  if and only if  $t \bullet Q \leq r$ , where  $t = (t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n)$  and  $t_i = \sup_j \{q_{ij} * r_j\}$ ,  $*$  is inverse operator of  $\bullet$ .

**Theorem 4.3.4 [L]:** Given  $Q$  and  $r$  if we define  $t_i = \sup_j (q_{ij} * r_j), \forall i = 1, 2, \dots, n$ , then  $t = (t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n)$  is the minimum solution of the equation  $p \bullet Q = r$ .

Let us assume that there exists solutions to the equation  $p \bullet Q = r$  so that  $T = (t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n)$  with  $t_i = \sup_j (q_{ij} * r_j), \forall i = 1, 2, \dots, n$ , is the minimum solution. To obtain maximal solutions of  $p \bullet Q = r$  for  $p$ , we shall introduce a matrix  $D = (d_{ij})_{n \times m}$  as follows:

$$d_{ij} = \begin{cases} q_{ij} \bar{*} r_j, & \text{if } q_{ij} \bullet t_i = r_j \\ 1, & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Here  $a \bar{*} b$  is the minimum solution of  $a \bullet x = b$ .

We assume that the maximum solution of  $a \bullet x = b$  exists.

**Theorem 4.3.5 [L]:** If  $D^* = (d_{ij}^*)_{n \times m}$  is a submatrix of matrix  $D$ , where  $d_{ij}^* = d_{ij}$  or  $1$ , such that  $\inf_i d_{ij}^* < 1$ , for  $r_j \neq 1$ ;  $j = 1, 2, \dots, m$ . Then  $A = (a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n)$  with  $a_i = \inf_j d_{ij}^*$ ,  $i = 1, 2, 3, \dots, n$  is a solution of the equation  $p \bullet Q = r$ .

**Theorem 4.3.6 [L]:** If  $A = (a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n)$  is a solution of equation  $p \bullet Q = r$ , then

$D(A) = (d(A)_{ij})_{n \times m}$ , is a submatrix of  $D$  and  $\inf_i d_{ij}^* < 1$ , for  $r_j \neq 1$ ,  $j = 1, 2, 3, \dots, m$ ,

where

$$d(A)_{ij} = \begin{cases} d_{ij}, & q_{ij} \bullet a_i = r_j \\ 1, & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

**Theorem 4.3.7 [L]:**  $\inf_i d(A)_{ij} \geq a_i$ .

### Method for calculating all maximal solutions [L]

Step 1: Write down the formula  $P$  of a matrix  $D$  as

$$P = \Pi \left( \sum_{i=1}^n d_{ij} \right), \text{ product over } j, r_j \neq 0.$$

(If  $d_{ij} = 1$  then omit it).

Calculate  $P$  in  $\Sigma$  from according to polynomial multiplication :

$$P = \Sigma dk_{111} dk_{212} \dots dk_{r1r}.$$

Step 2: 'Multiply' for all terms.

$$d_{pq} d_{rs} = \begin{cases} \min(d_p, d_{rs}) & r = p \\ \text{unchanged} & r \neq p \end{cases}$$

until the term  $d_{k_1 l_1} d_{k_2 l_2} \dots d_{k_r l_r}$  satisfies  $k_i \neq k_j, i \neq j$ .

Step 3: 'Sum' among terms

$$d_1 r_1 d_2 r_2 \dots d_n r_n + d_1 s_1 d_2 s_2 \dots d_n s_n$$

$$= \begin{cases} d_1 r_1 d_2 r_2 \dots d_n r_n; d_k r_k > d_k s_k; k=1; n \\ \text{unchanged} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

All maximal solutions are

$$T^* = (t_1^*, t_2^*, \dots, t_n^*)$$

$$\text{where } t_k^* = d_{k t_k}^*; k = 1, 2, \dots, n.$$