

Analysis and Interpretation

CHAPTER = III

ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

3.1 Data for Analysis:

As we have mentioned in the previous Chapter (2.5) we had sent the cloze form to twelve native speaker experts and received the completed forms from nine of them. On looking through the responses we found that one of the respondents had suggested several alternative items for almost every blank. In the case of the others it was found that five respondents had completed the form with a single word to fill each blank as required in a cloze exercise. The other three had suggested two or more items to complete some of the blanks.

Again three of the respondents (not the same three) did not offer any comments on problems relating to the grammar and the style of the original text. Two of the respondents thought that the story was culturally loaded and so they had some difficulty in deciding on the right items to fill the gaps.

3.2 Analysis of Data:

The responses of the eight informants were tabulated blank-wise and informant-wise. The hundred and seventy-four blanks were listed top to bottom. The actual words that occur in the original text were put against each blank number in the first column from left and right. Then the response/s of the eight informants to each of the blanks was put one after another from left to right.

Thus we had a large table with a hundred and seventy-four items from top to bottom and nine columns showing the various items supplied by the informants along with the original items against each blank from left to right. This gave a bird's eye view of the entire data.

We read the responses of the eight informants to each of the blanks from left to right and found that the responses could be classified into some four types. One of course was the exact word replacement. The others were synonyms, substitutes and free-variants in the context.

The items that were blanked accounted for content words and structure words in more or less the same proportion. There were eighty-nine structure words. The responses of informants were analysed and classified (See Table 3.2A). In the case of content words it was found that out of the eighty-five blanks only twenty-two responses were exact word replacement. The remaining alternative responses were classified into rephrasing and synonyms. The term 'synonym' is self-explanatory but what we call 'rephrasing' included several types of responses which were acceptable at both the sentence level and the discourse level.

Thirty-six out of the forty-five items classified under the heading of rephrasing belonged to the same grammatical class and the remaining nine items belonged to different grammatical classes. Both these categories presented a variety of responses (See table 3.2B)

As for structure words, it was found that fifty-three out of eighty-nine responses were exact-word replacements. The remaining responses fell into definite grammatical categories such as determiners, prepositions, pronouns etc. There only six cases of rephrasing which ranged from ϕ to any grammatical class of content words. (See table 3.2B)

At this stage of analysis it may be noted that alternative responses accounted for seventy-four percent in the case of content words and forty-three percent in the case of structure words. On the basis of this, a very general conclusion that may be drawn is that the text deviated more in respect of content words than in respect of structure words.

Table No. 3.2 A

Table showing the various types of responses given by the informants:

Content words:

	Frequency	Percentage
A. Exact replacement	22	26%
B. No/erroneous replacement	8	
C. Synonyms	* 20	74%
D. Rephrasing	* 45	
	* 93	
	=====	



* There are several cases of overlapping responses between these categories. Hence the total does not tally.

Structure words:

A. Exact replacement	53	57%
B. No/erroneous replacement	2	
C. Replacement by same word class:		
1. Determiner	11	
2. Preposition	7	
3. Pronoun	2	
4. Adverbial particle	1	43%
5. Conjunction	2	
6. Modal	2	
7. Sentence connector	1	
8. Intensifier	2	
D. Rephrasing	6	

89

=====

Table No. 3.2B

Table showing alternative responses

Rephrasing : Content words

Sr.No.	Blank No.	Words belonging to the same grammatical class
1.	2	ruler/man N N
2.	21	boy/cow-boy N N
3.	23	cow-boy/boys/marble-players N N N
4.	25	still/quietly/just adv adv adv
5.	26	mound/grass N N
6.	29	dispute/quarrel/problem/argument N N N N
7.	30	decide/solve/settle/resolve V V V V
8.	42	took/take/bring/brought V V V V
9.	43	cow-boy/boy N N
10.	45	disputes/cases/quarrels/argument N N N N
11.	51	surprised/impressed/pleased Adj Adj Adj
12.	52	spoke/acted/judged V V V
13.	56	disputes/quarrels/cases N N N
14.	62	wonderstruck/intrigued/curious/puzzled/ Adj Adj Adj Adj excited/interested/envious Adj Adj Adj

15.	67	court/county/kingdom N N N
16.	74	court/group/crowd/palace N N N N
17.	75	Great/Old/Wise Adj Adj Adj
18.	86	longed/had/was known V V V
19.	90	see/discover V V
20.	92	workmen/men/soldiers N N N
21.	95	black/white/polished/pure/carved/ancient Adj Adj Adj Adj Adj Adj
22.	96	black/polished/pure/white/ancient/ Adj Adj Adj Adj Adj carved/ Adj
23.	98	same/white Adj Adj
24.	103	people/crowds/angels/men/boys/cow-boys N N N N N N
25.	108	throbbing/filled/heaving/racing V V V V
26.	109	saw/ordered V V
27.	113	stood/knelt/sat V V V
28.	115	spirit/soul/God/memory N N N N
29.	120	King/ruler/kingdom/people N N N N
30.	139	said/replied V V
31.	149	few / set of/ lot of Quantifier Quantifier Quantifier

32.	150	answered/said/admitted V V V
33.	154	thought/prayed/hoped/begged V V V V
34.	167	slab/seat/throne N N N
35.	168	head/shoulder/back/wings N N N N
36.	169	sad/angry/dispirited Adj Adj Adj

Sr.No.	Blank No.	Words belonging to the different classes
1.	4	people/some/they N Pn Pn
2.	10	man/one N Pn
3.	28	Stop/Quit/You boys! V V Vocative
4.	54	cow-boy/boy/wise N N Adj
5.	59	town/then N Adv
6.	60	reached/to V Prep
7.	64	area/land/there/territory/village N N Adv N N
8.	73	wise/very Adj Intensifier
9.	171	tried/in order to/come V Prep V

Rephrasing : Structure words:

1.	12	<u>it/ ϕ</u>
2.	48	<u>the/green</u>
3.	70	<u>the/village</u>
4.	88	<u>Let's/You must/We must/Please</u>
5.	127	<u>not/guilty/unworthy</u>
6.	172	<u>and/Bhoj/He</u>

3.3 Content words:

Let's consider the cases of rephrasing and synonymy one after another.

3.3.1 Rephrasing:

As we have already noted thirty-six of the responses belonged to the same grammatical class. But items belonging to the same grammatical class supplied here indicate a number of different features. What is more, one of the alternative suggested is ϕ .

The following are the cases of alternative:

1. One day two cow-boy were playing marbles in the jungle while a third (boy) was sitting on a green mound.
2. While they were quarreling the third was (still) sitting on the green mound.
3. They brought their disputes to the little cow-boy judge.
4. The jungle area was a part of his kingdom.
5. The slab of black marble was supported by twenty-five angels.



Obviously, a \emptyset is acceptable in all these contexts most of which represent an attribute (cow-boy judge; jungle area; black marble) which can be dropped. In the other two cases one represents a case of elipsis of repeated noun and one of an optional adverb.

Nouns:

There are sixteen cases of alternative responses in respect of nouns. They are the following:

1. King Vikramaditya was a very wise, learned and just ruler.
man
2. One day two cow-boys were playing marbles in the jungle while a third boy was sitting on a green mound.
cow-boy
3. The two cow-boys started fighting.
boys
marble-players
4. While they were quarrelling the third was still sitting on the green mound.
grass
5. Bring your dispute to me. I will decide it.
quarrel
problem
argument
6. Since that day the cow-boys always took their quarrels to this cow-boy.
boy
7. He sat on the green mound and settled their disputes.
cases
quarrels
argument
8. He sat on the mound and settled their disputes wisely.
quarrels
cases
9. So he called the learned men of his court and...
county
kingdom

10. A wise old man in the court said...

group
crowd
palace

11. He sent many workmen to the mound.

men
soldiers

12. The people were watching it while it was being

crowds
angels
men
boys
cow-boys

carried to the King's palace.

13. Bhoj stood in front of the throne and prayed to the spirit of Vikramaditya.

soul
God
memory

14. ..., King! Have you never wished to conquer the territory of any other King?

ruler
kingdom
people

15. The angel heard the King's reply and flew away carrying the slab of marble on his head.

seat
throne

16. The angel heard the King's reply and flew away carrying the slab of marble on his head.

shoulder
back
wings

The noun alternatives suggested seem to fall into some broad sub-groups.

One, the alternation between boy and cow-boy in sentence No.2,3 and 6 are the cases in question. In sentence No.3 a third alternative marble-players appears. The respondents may have chosen the alternatives to avoid monotony or repetition of the

word cow-boy. Marble-players might have been suggested by the statement that they were playing marbles. This alternative also seems to support the view that the respondents wanted to avoid monotony.

If monotony is a feature of 'unnaturalness' of language, these responses are a pointer to it.

Two, the alternatives suggested for the noun dispute are quarrel, problem, argument, case in sentence No. 5, 7, 10. The choice of one or the other item seems to be conditioned by the verb that it collocates with. The verbs in question are settle, decide and bring.

settle → [dispute
quarrel
? case
? argument

decide → [dispute
case

bring → [dispute
quarrel
problem
? argument

Sentence No.5 seems to fall between two stools, with bring on one side and decide on the other.

This may also be another feature of unnaturalness of language.



Three, the alternatives suggested for court are county, kingdom, group, crowd, palace in sentence No. 9 and 10. Here too collocational restrictions seem to favour court more than any other alternative.

If the native speakers have slipped up on this, it may be because of cultural problems.

Four, the alternatives suggested for ruler and workmen are man and men/soldiers in sentence No.1 and 11 respectively. The item man is more general and the item soldier more specific. While man is entirely acceptable solider can be accepted only by a stretch of imagination that the king sent out soldiers even for digging!

Five, the alternatives for head in sentence No. 16 pertain to parts of the body of the angel. They are shoulder, back, wings. The original text has head.

The alternatives may have been suggested by the socio-cultural background of the native speaker respondents. Carry something on the head seems to be an Indian reality.

Lastly, the alternatives in the remaining sentences that is 12 to 15 do not seem to be significant in any way. Each alternative seems to stem from a different clue.

Adjectives:

There are seven cases of rephrasing of adjectives. They are the following:

1. One day they came to the green mound and were surprised
impressed
pleased
because the cow-boy, indeed, spoke very wisely.
2. King Bhoj of Malwa was wonderstruck when he heard
intrigued
curious
puzzled
excited
interested
envious

about the cow-boy-judge.
3. A wise old man in the court said, O King! the Great
Old
Wise

King Vikramditya once lived...
4. They dug deep into the ground and found a slab of
black marble.
white
polished
pure
carved
ancient
5. The slab of black marble was supported...
polished
pure
white
ancient
carved
6. The slab of black marble was supported by twenty-five
angels carved in the same stone.
white
polished
solid
supporting
7. The King became very sad.
angry
dispirited

Of the alternatives suggested for the seven adjectives two instances in sentence No.4 and 5 are black. It was discovered only at the time of analysis that there are no clues in the text

to suggest black.

Of the remaining five another adjective same in sentence No.6 attracted more or less the same set of alternatives as for black.

Again the original item wonderstruck in sentence No.2 was not supplied by any one of the informants. The alternatives given were pure adjectives like curious and envious and past participles like intrigued etc.

This may be an indication of an unnatural choice of item in the original.

The remaining three in sentence No.1, 3 and 7 represent alternative choices which seem to be suggested by different clues in the text.

Verbs:

There are eleven instances of rephrasing of verbs. They are the following:

1. Bring your dispute to me. I will decide it.
solve
settle
resolve

2. Since that day the cow-boys always took their quarrels
take
bring
brought

to this cow-boy.

3. One day they came to the green mound and were surprised because the cow-boy, indeed, spoke very wisely.
acted
judged

4. King Bhoj longed to be just and wise like the
had
was known

Great Vikramaditya.
5. "Let's dig deep into the ground", he said, "to see if
discover

Vikramaditya's judgement seat is there."
6. The King's heart was throbbing with excitement...
filled
heaving
racing
7. The King's heart was throbbing with excitement when
he saw the throne placed in the hall.
ordered
8. Bhoj stood in front of the throne...
knelt
sat
9. The King thought for a while and said, Yes, I have.
replied
10. Everytime the King answered that he was not
said
admitted

worthy of sitting on the throne.
11. The King thought that the last angel would allow him
prayed
hoped
begged

to sit on the seat..

The alternatives suggested for the eleven verbs fall into certain definite categories. Six of these are mental process verbs (Halliday in Kress, 1976: 164-66), spoke, see, saw, said, answered and thought. These occur in sentence No.3, 5, 7, 9, 10 and 11. The alternatives suggested are mostly mental process verbs with a shift in the mode of process -- perception, cognition or verbalization. There are one or two exceptions like

acted for spoke in sentence No.3 and ordered for saw in sentence No.7. But they are acceptable in the larger context. The choice of these other alternatives or the result of the narrator's view of the event.

The choice of alternatives for the verb decide in sentence No.1 depends on dispute in the earlier sentence which is a matter of collocation. We have already referred to this in the section on nouns.

The alternative for took in sentence No.2 is brought. This choice is conditioned again by the point of view of the narrator. However, the choice of a present tense form (bring and take) seem to be conditioned by the preposition since in the sentence. In fact, one of the informants has suggested a change: from in place of since which would go with the past tense forms.

This is clearly a deviation from naturalness.

Similarly, the original item throbbing in sentence No.6 has not been supplied by any of the informants. The most preferred alternative is filled. This also seems to be an indication of unnaturalness.

Of the remaining two the alternatives for stood in sentence No.8 are action verbs. The original item stood has not been supplied by any of the informants. The most preferred alternative is knelt. And the alternatives for longed in sentence No.4 are very diverse, but acceptable in the context.



Adverbs:

There is only one instance of rephrasing of adverb. It is the following:

1. While they were quarrelling the third was still sitting
quietly
just
on the green mound.

The alternative responses are all adverbs of the same category -- manner. The choices seem to be no more than subjective.

Quantifier:

There is only one case of rephrasing of Quantifier.

1. Each of the angels asked the King a few questions.
set of
lot of

The alternatives are all quantifiers. But a couple of informants have pointed out that a singular question is referred to in the story. Therefore all the alternatives including the original are indefensible.

This is a particularly noticeable erroneous, unnatural feature.

Other parts of speech:

There are nine instances in which the original part of speech has been replaced by other part/s of speech. Five of them have nouns in the original, three have verbs and one has an adjective.

Nouns:

The following are the sentences in which nouns are replaced by other parts of speech:

1. Even now people say that...
some
they
2. ... the man who lost the case and the man who won it.
one
3. They brought their disputes to the little cow-boy
boy
wise

judge.
4. Thus the news of the little judge spread from village to village and town to town and finally reached
then

the capital of Malwa.
5. The jungle area was a part of his kingdom.
land
territory
there
village

In sentence No.1 and 2 the noun people and man are replaced by pronouns which are acceptable in the context. In sentence No.3 the noun cow-boy is replaced by an adjective wise which is also an attribute to the following noun judge which could be dropped. Indeed, one of the informants has supplied a \emptyset . In sentence No.4 the noun town has been replaced by an adverb then which is acceptable in the context although town is a better alternative. In sentence No.5, the noun area has been replaced by other nouns land/territory/village, an adverb there. Of these alternatives land, there and village are rather unacceptable. territory and \emptyset are acceptable.

Verbs:

The following are the three sentences in which the alternatives for the original verb have been supplied with other parts of speech:

1. Stop fighting there.
You boys
Quit
2. Thus the news of little judge spread from village to village and town to town, and finally reached the
to
capital of Malwa.
3. Then the wise old man who had spoken earlier tried to comfort the King and said, ...
came
in order to

In sentence No.1, the verb stop has been replaced by another verb Quit and a vocative expression You boys. Both alternatives are acceptable. But the different alternatives suggest the view of the narrator.

In sentence No.2 the verb reached is replaced by the preposition to. It may be mentioned that everyone of the informants have supplied the preposition to.

The original item reached, therefore, seems to be unnatural.

The alternative came for tried in sentence No.3 is acceptable. But the complex preposition in order to is syntactically unacceptable.



SAR. BALASABH KHARDEKAR LIBRARY
SHIVAJI UNIVERSITY, KOLHAPUR

Adjective:

There is only one sentence in which the original adjective wise has been replaced by the intensifier very:

1. A wise old man in the court said, ...
very

These are free variants in the context.

3.3.2 Synonyms:

Out of the twenty original items for which the informants supplied synonyms, eleven were nouns, five adjectives and four verbs. We shall look at these one by one.

Nouns:

The following sentences show the different alternatives supplied for the original nouns:

1. King Vikramaditya was a very wise, learned and just ruler.
King
monarch
2. Everyone who brought a dispute before him for judgement went away satisfied...
settlement
arbitration
3. ... the man who lost the case and and man who won it.
person
4. Hundreds of years after the death of Vikramaditya his palace and other great buildings fell into ruins, and a jungle grew there.
forest
5. He makes no mistake in his judgement.
mistakes
error/s
6. He sent many workmen to the mound.
workers
labourers

7. The people were watching it while it was carried to the King's palace, where it was placed in a big hall.
chamber
room
8. Bhoj stood in front of the throne and prayed to the
seat
spirit of Vikramaditya.
9. The King was trembling with fear when the angel spoke.
fright
terror
10. Everytime the King answered that he was not worthy of sitting on the seat.
throne
11. The King thought for a while and said, "No, it is not".
moment

The alternatives supplied are motivated by several considerations like choice at the discourse level, registral and collocational restrictions for example, in sentence No.1, ruler, king, and monarch all belong to the same register and could be considered as free variants. Similarly, in sentence No.8 and 10 seat and throne would belong to the same register in the context of the story. There are two other synonyms forest for jungle and error for mistake in sentence No.4 and 5 respectively which are conditioned by the native speakers' use of language. While the item workers for workmen in sentence No.6 may be a free variant, the item labourers seems to smack of post Industrial Revolution error. This does not go well with the historical period in which the story is set.

The alternative item moment for the original while in sentence No.11 occurs in all the informants' responses. No one has supplied while. This is because the context does not seem to

allow a period of time reference.

Sentence No.2, 7 and 9 have items which depend on other items in the context with which they are required to collocate. In sentence No.2 and 9 the alternative items suggested seem to collocate with the relevant items in the context. But in the case of sentence No.3 and 7 the informants seem to have erred in the choice of person for man and room for hall. The cues in the passage do not permit these choices.

It appears, therefore, that the item while in sentence No.11 is an unnatural choice.

Adjectives:

The following are the five instances of different alternatives for adjectives supplied by informants:

1. One day they came to the green mound and were surprised because the cow-boy, indeed, spoke very
amazed
astonished

wisely.
2. King Bhoj of Malwa was wonderstruck...
surprised
3. He said, "Now I'm sure that I'll never make a mistake
certain

of judgement.
4. The King became very sad.
downcast
depressed
5. I'm certain that no King on earth can sit on
sure

the throne.

The alternative supplied for the adjectives surprised in sentence No.1, wonderstruck in sentence No.2 and sad in sentence No.4 are all free variants. The choice seems to be rather subjective except for the item downcast in place of sad because downcast occurs elsewhere in the text.

The alternatives supplied for both sure and certain in sentence No.3 and 5 turned out to be consistently the same item-- either sure or certain. Sure occurs six times whereas certain occurs only two times.

What seems to be unnatural here is the alternation-- once sure and another time certain in the original text.

Verbs:

The following are the four sentences in which alternatives for verbs occur:

1. The cow-boys stopped fighting.
quarrelling
2. King Bhoj longed to be just and wise like the
wanted
wished

Great Vikramaditya.
3. The King's heart was throbbing with excitement when
beating

he saw the throne placed in the hall.
4. Every time the King answered that he was not worthy
replied

of sitting on the throne.

The alternatives for longed in sentence No.2 and answered in sentence No.4 seem to be free variants. However, the

alternative quarrelling for the original item fighting in sentence No.1 seems to come from the clues in the earlier part of the text. On a close examination, it appears that the two words alternate without any justification.

This could be another feature of unnaturalness.

In sentence No.3 not a single informant has supplied the original item throbbing. We have seen in the section of rephrasing that filled is the most preferred alternative. However, at least one informant had supplied beating which is acceptable.

It may be repeated that the choice of the item throbbing seems to be unnatural.

3.4 Structure words:

Out of the eighty-nine blanks fifty-three were filled out with exact-word replacement that is 57% of the responses were exact-word replacement. The alternative responses accounted for forty-three percent. A very general conclusion that may be drawn from this is that the text deviated less in respect of structure words. Now let us look at the responses.

3.4.1

The alternative responses fall into eight grammatical classes following. Quirk et al (1974: 61-63) as shown in table No.3.2A.

Determiner:

There are eleven cases of alternative responses in the

case of determiners. They are the following:

1. Everyone who brought a dispute before him for
their
judgement went away satisfied.
2. The villagers heard about the cow-boy who sat on
this
the mound.
3. He sat on the mound and settled their disputes wisely.
his
4. King Bhoj of Malwa was wonderstruck when he heard about
the cow-boy judge.
this
5. So he called the learned men of his court.
some
6. "The cow-boy sits on a green mound and decides the
disputes of the people".
these
my
7. The seat of Vikramaditya must be under the mound.
that
8. The King's heart was throbbing with excitement when
he saw the throne placed in the hall.
his
9. When he touched the marble, one of the angels said, ...
Vikramaditya's
10. I'm not worthy of sitting on the seat.
this
11. ... during this period twenty four angels flew away.
that
each

Out of the eleven replacements we find that in the case of sentence No.3, 8 and 9 the determiners are replaced by other determiners belonging to the same class that is class A (the is replaced by a possessive noun or pronoun).

In sentence No.2, 4, 7 and 10 determiner class A is

replaced by another determiner class (that is the is replaced by this or that).

In the case of the remaining four sentences we find that the original determiners are replaced by others belonging to different classes.

All the replacements are syntactically acceptable. Some replacements, however, indicate the point of view, for example when the article the is replaced by either this or that shows that the speaker is in the immediate presence of what he is pointing to. This is perhaps more natural than a neutral the.

Prepositions:

There are seven cases of replacements of one preposition by another. The following are the cases of replacement:

1. He never made an error of judgement.
in
2. The cow-boys from the neighbouring villages grazed
in
of
their cows there.
3. One day two cow-boys were playing marbles in the
near
jungle...
4. They went to him and told him the cause of their
over to
fighting.
5. Thus the news of the little judge spread from village
about
to village.
6. ... the mind is the mind of Vikramaditya which speaks
through the boy's lips.
from

7. Ninety six days passed in this way and...
by

All the alternatives are syntactically acceptable. But semantically there are marginal differences. The different choices seem to indicate the respondents' or the speakers' conceptualization of the reality.

Pronouns:

There are two instances of replacement of pronouns. The following are the cases of replacement of pronouns:

1. Both the boys were surprised but they were satisfied
both
too.
2. "Have you never desired to acquire someone else's
anyone
anybody
wealth?

The replacements are syntactically acceptable. But in the case of sentence No.2 the original pronoun someone seems to suggest that Vikramaditya had indeed desired to acquire someone else's wealth. This seems to be a little unnatural.

Adverbial Particle:

The following is the only sentence in which one adverbial particle is replaced by the other.

1. "Then fast and pray for another three day",
said the angel and flew away.
off

The alternative responses are fully acceptable. There seems to be nothing special about the choice of the one or the other.

Conjunctions:

Alternative responses were supplied in the case of the following two sentences:

1. "The cow-boy sits on a green mound and decides the
who
disputes of the people.
2. The people were watching it while it was being carried
when
as
to the Kng's palace, ...

In sentence No.1, the alternative who is syntactically acceptable but seems to sound odd. In the case of sentence No.2, the alternatives when and as are both acceptable. The original item while was dictated by the requirement of fabrication. One of the teaching points built into the passage is the use of while and when. An attempt has been made to distinguish between the use of when and while through the fabricated text.

Modals:

The following are the two sentences in which different alternatives have been supplied:

1. What may be the reason?
could
can
2. The King thought that the last angel would allow him
could
might
to sit on the seat.

Although the alternatives are fully acceptable, the most common modal in the context of the first sentence is could and not the original may. This is perhaps an indication of an

unnatural choice of modal.

Sentence connector:

Alternative responses were supplied for the original sentence connector but in the following context.

1. The King fasted and prayed for three days and then came to sit on the seat. But another angel asked, ...
Then
However

The alternatives are acceptable. Both But and However convey the sense of contrast. Then conveys a sense of sequence. Interestingly, the majority of respondents have chosen Then.

The context seems to favour a sequence marker. So the original But may be an unnatural choice.

Intensifiers:

Alternative responses have been supplied for the intensifier very in the following sentences:

1. King Vikramaditya was a very wise, learned and most
just ruler.
2. He was also a very famous judge.

An intensifier is syntactically optional. But semantically the context seems to need an intensifier. And both the responses are acceptable.

3.4.2 Rephrasing:

There are six cases of rephrasing of structure words with anything from ϕ to a phrase. The following are the alternatives

supplied:

1. ... the man who lost the case and the man who won it.
2. The villagers heard about the cow-boy who sat on the mound.
green
3. The cow-boy sits on a green mound and decides the disputes of the people.
village
4. Let's dig deep into the gourd.
You must
We must
Please
5. I'm afraid I'm not.
guilty
unworthy
6. Then the wise old man who had spoken earlier tried to comfort the King and said, ...
Bhoj
He

In sentence No.1 \emptyset instead of it syntacally acceptable and perhaps more natural as an ellipsis for repeated NP. In sentence No.4 the alternative simply converts the first person polite impertive into a second person command which is probably more natural for a King to do. The other alternatives with the modal must are equally possible. But Please is a little unexpected. In sentence No.5 the alternatives guilty and unworthy are syntactically acceptable but unlikely in the context of a great King like Vikramaditya. The alternatives supplied in the sentence No.6 somehow assume a full stop after King. As such they are acceptable. At the discourse level, Bhoj would be unacceptable. The original seems to be alright.

In the case of sentence No.2 and 3, the determiner the has been replaced by an adjective green and a noun village. While the

second is syntactically acceptable, the first would not be.

3.5

From the analysis of the responses from the native speaker experts it appears that there is a good deal of different responses from them as compared to the items in the original. It also appears that there are some differences among themselves. We shall try to sum up the conclusions from these responses in the next chapter.